

**Communities Within:
Diversity and Exclusion in Ottawa**

**Les communautés au sein de notre ville :
la diversité et l'exclusion à Ottawa**



An initiative of the Social Planning Council of Ottawa
Un projet du Conseil de planification sociale d'Ottawa



Theoretical Framework and Contribution to Empirical Analysis

Norah Barongo-Muweke

2006

A project funded by
Canadian Heritage, Multiculturalism and Aboriginal Programs
The City of Ottawa
United Way Ottawa

With the collaboration of Carleton University



INTRODUCTION:

Drawing on a case study empirical research on three different minority communities in Ottawa, this paper integrates a structural analysis and incorporates a mixed methodology with multi-disciplinary insights combining mainstream, feminist approaches and grounded theory to explore the social construction of minorities within exclusionary and marginalization processes as illustrated through outcomes relating to economic participation; education; spatial processes; social networks/ social capital as well as; civic participation and draw from such an analysis policy recommendations grounded in empirical realities to foster social inclusion and social cohesion through voice development.

It is organized into four sections. The first section introduces the key empirical findings in relation to their policy implications and empirical linkage to the development of our analytical framework. The second and third part explore the theoretical models applied in our empirical analysis. This will also highlight ways in which pedagogical and sociological concepts have been incorporated as analytical tools while also demonstrating their empirical relevance. The fourth part applies the theoretical models to the empirical findings and presents a summary of overarching issues emerging.

I. Key issues with Policy and Analytical Implications

Given the objectives of the study, this section briefly outlines the key findings and basic consideration on which to base strategies for policy development and best practice in countering marginalization within the context of Ottawa's social diversity, immigration environment and fundamental institutional constraints.

The findings indicate significant differences in the experiences of exclusion for the different communities studied both in terms of the dimensions, social outcomes and their implications for socio-stratification. This implies that any strategic objectives and policy intervention will necessarily be conceived based on a recognition of this asymmetry; it's reflection within the community as well as an identification of the most vulnerable groups, in order to facilitate the projected changes.

From an analytical point of view, there is considerable evidence to suggest that the differential experiences of social exclusion observed must be conceived within the context of the differential structural embedment of the affected which appears primarily instantiated through institutional and systemic processes conditioning integration into the labor market and their complex interplay with the dimensions of time and space as well as a host of historical, social and economic factors, diverse in their causes and unique to each group.

Special attention has to be paid to the relevance of conceptualizing social differentiation in terms of ethnization processes as opposed to racialization. This perspective while empirically emerging seems to provide a more pragmatic approach to the dynamics of exclusion, diversity and social cohesion: Within a deconstructionist framework, ethnicity appears constituted as a structure constructed not only structurally within multidimensional inequalities of power but in their interplay with time, spatial factors as well as symbolic, cultural and historical processes.

In view of the prevailing social heterogeneity, the pillar for long term strategy should be constructing convergence in the Canadian identity based on social values as opposed to ethnicity. Stress should not be put on minority communities as fixed categories but on the dynamic nature of hybrid identities and the degree of their linkages to different cultures particularly mainstream society. Relevance of identity building is emphasized in view of Canada's immigration context and colonial history.

In the education realm, there is a need for empowering students through transparent and standardized curricula, which should focus on exploring concepts of tolerance, justice, social solidarity, self-sacrifice etc., based on how these are practiced in the different religions. Thus, promoting dialogue and intercultural competences through proactive policy intervention.

II. Conceptual framework for analysis: A Mixed Methodological Approach combining Mainstream Concepts, Anti-racist Feminist Theories, and Grounded Theory

Feminist models attempt at theorizing exclusion away from the gender blindness and cumulative models criticized in mainstream approaches to provide a much more concise view of the structural inequalities at work through an integration of the dimensions of gender, ethnicity and class as categories of analysis. Central to their analysis is a deconstructionist perspective, which identifies gender and ethnicity as socially constructed categories configured within the intersection of complex relations of domination and power whose interplay cannot be conceived only in additive terms but in their simultaneous interplay structuring multiplied risks and constraints.

Dimensions of Differences and Inequality: Race, Gender, Ethnicity, and class,

Mainstream women do not or have not experienced being or having been colonized, absolute poverty, Taking into account the first dimension of difference, such models view femaleness i.e. position of women in society as the first level exposing them to mechanisms structuring social discrimination and gender inequality. This is compounded by their class as foreign-born workers and nationality (ethnicity) with a weak social and economic position. Thus crystallizing vulnerability, which also leads to exploitation (See Hillman 1996:46; Lim 1995:51 etc.). Feminist migration research (Guemen 1998) and findings from research on gender and race (Horn-Metzger & Rieger 1995) further allow us to integrate 'maleness' as an important element of social differentiation through a focus on structural underpinnings constructing stereo-types or dominant images in our analysis.

Subjectivity and Consciousness

Subjectivity and consciousness constitute further components added to the analytical dimensions and they are significantly gaining meaning. Wetterer (1992) and Becker Schmidt (1995) emphasize a focus on the self and its construction in relation to reflexivity by investigating the role of the active performing individual in light of their ability to change structures. Looking at modes of self-construction and their implications for agency, Morokvasic (1983) argues for a coherent attention to consciousness as a category of analysis. Basing on the example of migrant women, she proposed a fourth dimension to the threefold-vulnerability model to illustrate that women are discriminated against not only because they are women or because they belong to the working class and are members of the minority groups but also because they are socialized into accepting subordination as normal. It is through the work of post-structuralist and postcolonial subaltern discourses like Spivak's analysis of consciousness and its construction within historical situativity, ideology and geo-political conditionings that implications of the interplay between agency, discourse and institutional processes become most apparent (See 1989). In the same light, Althausser (1971) usefully conceives the self as a structured category whereby subjectivity is constructed on the basis of heterogeneous regimes, institutional dynamics, daily norms and practices. Pedagogy combines the perspectives developed here to integrate a

transformatory approach that takes into account not only the consciousness of the affected but also the communities in which they are embedded (See Freire 1972).

Despite their gender blindness, the empirical findings strongly suggest that mainstream approaches can usefully be applied particularly because of their potential for shedding light to the dimension of economic integration in the analysis. What is central to both approaches and to the empirical findings is the approach to social differentiation through a structural analysis of socially stratifying mechanisms in a context emphasizing theorization within relational differences while also integrating multiplicative, intersectionality, deterioration models and aspects of time. Whereas feminist approaches predominantly focus on gender, ethnicity, class and subjectivity categories, Estivil presents a framework for expounding on the dimensions of space as well as broadening the concept of time in ways which facilitate analysis of economic cycles, demographic changes and the intergenerational transmission of the condition of exclusion (2003: 51).

Within the framework of gender mainstreaming, we trace the opportunity for overcoming tensions between mainstream and feminist approaches to provide a more coherent understanding of the dynamics of exclusion and social cohesion as they relate to minority groups within a diversity context.

Research Focus

As a point of departure this paper combines Estivil's concept of exclusion with feminist theories investigating difference within professionalization processes through a structural analysis of the causes of marginalization on the labor market combined with a pedagogical inquiry into the existing forms of consciousness and approaches for transforming this marginalization through the affected themselves (See Wetterer 1992). These perspectives will be combined with the fourfold vulnerability model to investigate multiplicity and inter-

sectionality of socially differentiating phenomena by demonstrating how the embeddedness of ethnicity, gender, class and subjectivity as structured categories configured within the simultaneous interplay of complex relations of domination, power, daily norms and practices compounds social exclusion for both women and men. Emphasis here will be on demonstrating the link between ways in which spatial processes are structurally configured and their implications for economic integration, which as we shall argue, is the key determinant of social capital and civic participation. Basing on Bordieu (1977, 1984, and 1993) this analytical scope will be expanded to incorporate the empirical relevance of symbolic interaction and cultural configurations of class.

Looking at 'volunteerism' we will draw on Bordieu's concept of Habitus, social field and unequal incorporation to demonstrate the impact of prevailing norms. This will be concretized through Giddens's structuration theory which is applied here to usefully conceptualize the link between structure and agency in a context not only bringing into our analysis a critical reflection on consciousness both at subjectivity and community levels but also stressing the meaning of complex social, historical and cultural processes at the heart of shaping agency. Basing on the term 'visible minority', the empirical relevance of discursive practices, institutional processes and self-determination will be thematized linking mechanisms of hierarchization and ascription to the social construction of subjectivity.

We will integrate pedagogical insights to conceptualize consciousness within emancipatory practice that incorporates both the level of subjectivity and social reflexivity in the broader community in a context locating the 'human being' at the center of all transformatory action and focuses on capacity building by empowering both the affected and their communities to impact against social inequality while consciously molding social cohesion through raised critical reflection on inequitable structures - Facilitating bottom up processes. Basing on Derrida (1994) and Spivak (1989) the data on 'Canadian Identity', will be conceptualized within a feminist deconstruction approach which emphasizes the logic and discursive context in which narratives are constructed

(See also Gutierrez Rodriguez 1998).

III. Grounded Theory: Methodological Application

Grounded theory as presented by Strauss and Glaser (1967) has been the major scientific frame for giving voice to the affected. This is done by letting the empirical world emerge through adopting an open approach that avoids enforcing predetermined frames and through Glaser (1978) theoretical sensitivity that aspires to inductively generate theory from data within a transformative or workability context for the affected. We will stress doing theory using concepts as basic units of analysis rather than descriptive accounts and through grouping concepts, we will identify the major categories at a higher level of abstraction, their properties and the relationship between them which will also highlight the dependent and independent variables. We will also generate hypothesis from the empirical emergings to define the generalized relationships between categories and their concepts (Glaser & Strauss 1967)

Data analysis is guided mainly by theoretical sampling whereby data collection, coding and analysis are jointly carried out. Coding is done through constant comparison of incident by incident to identify the underlying meaning, uniformity as well as contrasting patterns in data. Note that existing theoretical frames have been used only as supplements to refine the concepts after they had emerged. Whereas the emerging categories reflect a complex and multi-dimensional phenomena, multidisciplinary insights will be incorporated in the analysis.

IV. Application of Theoretical Framework to Empirical Analysis

Structural Embedment: Four Fold Relative Vulnerability

And the Interplay with Time and Space Dimensions

Institutional processes, A- historization mechanisms, and power Dynamics

To illustrate empirically the relevance of the four-fold vulnerability model, it seems logical to debate exclusion in terms of institutional contexts structuring difference and inequality in the spatial construction of skills legitimated by a- historization mechanisms adequately concretized in the term 'Canadian Experience' with its inherent bipolar logic explicitly incorporating a deficit approach to ability as it relates to the international experience of immigrants. But these mechanisms also seem to constitute ethnocentric and reductionist notions of difference as well as hegemonic relations affecting incorporation into labor markets, social-networks and institutionalizing precariousness. Thus, they can further be analyzed in terms of their impact in masking structural underpinnings of hierarchies and power-relations constructing social-inequalities.

To support this argument with evidence, we can draw from the narratives of a pediatrician with an educational- and training background from Russia. She has been denied praxis for twelve years now on grounds of non-recognition for foreign credits as 'internationally trained physician'. Given the compatibility of the health environmental factors in Russia with those in Canada, there seems to be no sustainable positions for explaining inequality here other than through emphasizing a structural perspective. Observations here suggest that social stratification is a direct consequence of the structured nature of the large inequalities in power and historical relations as specifically reflected through the role of industrial relations and the emergence of new managerial groups. It has been demonstrated that the Canadian Medical Association seems to illustrate the impact of industrial relations in a context institutionalizing precariousness by maintaining artificial barriers to the labor market, which is legitimated through institutional devaluation of skills. The impacts of new managerial groups can be illustrated through the work biography in view, whereby the foreign trained pediatrician not only experiences downward occupational mobility and occupational segregation in the service sector but

also works under marketized employment relations in a significantly deteriorated contractual and legal environment as a source of cheap flexible labor, working irregular hours under unsheltered employment conditions and lacking any job security.

In policy terms, the importance of empirically investigating ethnicity lies in the fact that new entrants in the job market are likely to be more vulnerable because of seeking Canadian experience. It is significant that this constitutes the group that is less capacitated to achieve eligibility conditions for employment insurance.

Clearly, the above example seems to demonstrate how social inequality is constituted as a structured set of social relations.

To broaden our perspective on the inter-sectionality and multiplicativity of the empirical phenomena, data from different narratives can be used to illustrate how a dichotomization emerges in time processes arising from the manufactured inequality within the spatial skills construction and producing what appears to constitute in Meillasoux's terms organic relations within capitalistic modes of production:

To conceptualize our data, it could be argued here that minority groups become integrated as peri-ferial sectors within the capitalistic spheres of circulation in such a way that capital (labor power and commodities) are extracted from them but not reinvested in them. Thus, remaining outside the sphere of production (See 1981). Therefore what authors have identified as a racialization of poverty with an increased reflection of the conditions prevailing in peri-ferial region of the world (See Galabuzi 2001) appear concretized here as the contradictory organization of economic relations in which different relations of production predominate whereby one sector dominates and begins to change the other producing economic dualism¹: One sector becomes maintained as a means of social organization from which the other benefits not only pumping its subsistence but also

¹ The dichotomies, binaries and polarisation traced at all levels of society

depriving it of its means of reproduction consequently destroying it in the end (See Meillasoux 1981).

To demonstrate partially on the basis of our data, dichotomization of time and space needs to be understood through its implications for the fragmentation of work biographies, life chances and life conditions. References were broadly made to the huge losses in terms of time and financial resources spent in retraining skills in which more often than not foreign trained minorities had already gained sufficient training. Needless to say that without strategic objectives and policy, minorities will continue to exist in a context of different time zone and space parallel to the mainstream counterparts. As we shall demonstrate below institutional networking through apprenticeship programs in colleges has also seemed to create barriers for minority groups through inadequate counseling on career assessments and market chances provided. This has had detrimental consequences: i.e. unsuccessful integration into labor markets bringing about a loss of capital investments and increasing the credit burden.

Basing on Meillasoux (1981) again organic relations can be also partially demonstrated between the family as the institution within which birth nature, education of children takes place and which is therefore the center for the production and reproduction of the labor force. However the same paradox where domestic relations of reproduction are organically combined with capitalist relations of production are seen to operate here as well. In this context, our narratives indicate that the difficulties which minority families face bring them to the realization that their actual benefits of migrating will lie in the second generation (their children).

Selectivity, Heirarchization, Habitus and Marginalization:

Indeed exclusion due to non-recognition of foreign credentials seems to constitute a central conditioning mechanism and selective instrument structuring hierarchy and marginalization at diverse levels. This is clearly demonstrated through the narratives of a

single mother: Her narrative is specifically important because it can be used to show the extents and ways in which institutional contexts underpin the intersections of gender, class and ethnicity not only structurally conditioning the spatial dynamics of network integration, but also determining incorporation into the labor market. As different data will later indicate, barriers to the labor market represent the dependent variable and core category, which is identified also as the prime instrument of widespread social differentiation.

It is significant that her foreign credentials were not recognized whereas a male college with the same credentials and background was allowed to pursue a master's degree because of his status as international student. The participant illustrates in detail that the non-recognition of credits was based upon her previous status as a refugee and describes how this hindered her studies and career development in her professional field, inducing her eventual participation in the niche economy. Here she could find work based on the high demand for language skills and cultural knowledge reproducing segregation based on ethnicity and gender.

At this point, it seems important to draw into our framework of analysis a further dimension constituting the 'Habitus' as defined by Bordieu: Looking at networking and voluntarism both as mechanisms and norms strongly characterizing the Canadian environment, the implications for a contextualized approach to the fourfold model of discrimination and its convergence within specifics of the 'Habitus' become uniquely manifested. Not only do the structural conditionalities processing social differentiation for Ottawa's visible minorities become clear but also the interplay with factors found in the social field which re-enforce social stratification. Thus, the implications of the internalization of structure at the community level and the need for integrating consciousness as a category of analysis. Our data speaks a clear language showing how minorities become trapped in a vicious cycle of vulnerabilities directly linked to their structural conditioning. We see a dichotomization of society instantiated through the establishment of inequality in the spatial skills construction as well as time and reinforced

through the 'Habitus' with fundamental implications for the dynamics of spatial segregation, the quality of network formation and regressive labor market incorporation (See below).

An integration of the time dimension, symbolic processes and socio-historical factors seems to dispute the theory of 'racialization' and draws into the center impacts of complex inter-sectionality of social mechanisms and power inequalities producing and re-enforcing dichotomies as well as capitalistic organic relations.

From another perspective, it seems adequate to debate these issues in terms of binaries and a structural process that instantiates social stratification through a multiplication of social differences along the lines of class, ethnicity, gender, time and space etc. It is possible to postulate once again through the ideas developed here that exclusion and inequality are socially manufactured constructs which can hence be deconstructed through policy intervention.

Inter-sectionality, Cumulative Effects and Deterioration Paths:

Quality of Networks and Intergenerational Transmission: Experiences of exclusion regarding education, training and labor market for the second generation have been largely identified as an inter-generationally transmitted structural impediment. This seems to be the aspect of it that falls under our category. Civic participation and family issues have also been linked to the quality of networks with the same understanding that they are structurally conditioned through marginalization in the labor market. As an expert interview also demonstrated, working unconventional hours hinders many from civic participation. Similarly family re-unification is constrained through lack of adequate income to sponsor relatives.

One major issue regarding quality of networks concerns the need for facilitating institutional networking for minorities as an important criterion in policy intervention: As partially demonstrated above, inequality in spatial processes conditioning network formation empirically appear to derive from the dichotomies created between skills production and the consequential unequal incorporation into the labor market. Where networking is largely conditioned by the level of structural embedment and quality of networks within the 'Habitus' of voluntarism, reductionist concepts of difference seem to be consequently built on through a series of mechanisms which anchor and further legitimate inequality by constraining the individual agency of immigrants.

For the affected minorities this seems to have major implications for networking. This is especially so in view of the induced loss of an autonomous economic status bringing about increased dependencies and vulnerabilities to the influences of social housing policy. As the Somali and Chinese Community have indicated, the level of integration into the labor market has been the major determinant of the quality of neighborhood. This does not only have direct relevance for ethnic segregation but also for producing crisis in identities because of the poor socio-economic conditions in a context where impacts such as those identified in the organic relations have diminishing effects on minority communities' protective factors. The narratives addressed the problematic of increased youths at risks and vulnerability for entering the juvenile justice systems (targeted by drug traffickers and prostitution). Several sources from the interviews seem to suggest a decline in the moral-, educational-, social status and lives of many youths upon arrival in Canada.

In social policy terms, the case of networks seems to strongly indicate that, structural exclusion based on ethnicity has influenced class formation between the dominant categories and marginalized groups, constraining self-determinism with detrimental consequences for social cohesion. On the other hand as the broad literature has also demonstrated, our findings seem to suggest that structured nature of exclusion, while reinforcing power hierarchies and differential social positioning is directly linked to the

reproduction of other complex and heterogeneous forms of exclusion experienced by minorities:

It is significant that ethnic networks in which minorities facing marginalization from the mainstream become inserted are broadly identified as patterned by further socially stratifying mechanisms of power hierarchies and material relations along the lines of class, gender and ethnicity.

In the Somali community the high degree of social vulnerability was identified as reinforcing dependencies and self-ghettorization. As an expert interview has demonstrated the vulnerability can be conceptualized in terms of the 'three Rs' combined with the absence of strong networks because of the relatively short settlement period. The 'three Rs' refer to the constraints of the socio-background status as refugee, interacting with religion (Islam), and race (ethnicity). For some groups, difficulties of generating social capital were aggravated by religious barriers to accessing credit.

In the Lebanese community, the relative vulnerability was also concretized but the presence of stronger networks due to the longer settlement time minimized the impacts. Gender emerged as a major distinguishing category in the division of labor and in the cultural construction of images i.e. 'the good girl Vs bad girl', etc. The salience of religious identities seems to play a further role as a social classification category.

Divorce appears to be increasingly manifested in some communities. It is important to investigate the social construction of masculinities in relation to ways in which lack of male role models affect boys and youths.

Institutional Networking: This seems inevitably required in view of the major barriers faced by individuals in a context where most institutions are already networked as the case of coop placements and volunteers from the variety of government organizations and service providers illustrates. Strategic objectives for policy development should empower

organizations like OCISO, Volunteer Ottawa etc, to develop programs for institutional networking and operate based on an investigation of the empirical reality through community research and needs assessment. Special support for new immigrants who need to acquire professional experience, education and training with adequate orientation would automatically promote integration.

As others have already pointed out, the quality of networks and flow of information constitute a prime instrument facilitating incorporation into labor markets: Our findings indicate, however, that minorities face marginalization not only because of the insecurities identified within informal networking but also within institutional networking. This is partially illustrated by differences in the types of Co-op placements, whereby dominant groups are suitably matched with placement positions enhancing skills development and more often than not, facilitating future job security. For the affected minorities, exclusion within co-op placements conditioned occupational processes by often hindering integration into their professional field and inducing career changes into totally new fields. Hence subjecting them also to substantial losses in time and invested capital. On the other hand institutional networking through apprenticeship programs in colleges has also seemed to create barriers for minorities through inadequate counseling on career assessments and market chances provided. As already demonstrated above, this has had detrimental consequences: i.e. unsuccessful integration into labor markets and again loss of capital investments, credit burden etc. The issue regarding internationally trained physicians can be highlighted once again here. Our data revealed that the public funds released for the professional integration flowed mostly into a middleman process of consultation. One of the major shortcomings here seems to lie in the identified wide gaps between the realities facing minorities on the ground and the perceived problems addressed by the programs.

With further regard to the flow of information, our findings on the social networks of minorities as clearly demonstrated by the example of international students appeared to be weak and this was mainly because they are largely based on ethnicity.

Apparently in spite of the existence of a wide range of services for international students, it seems that many are less informed about issues of central importance to their socio-economic integration in Canada. Some of the identified reasons according to participant observation seem to derive from problems of orientation in a totally new environment with different systems and function. Others concerned cultural differences in communication i.e. problem approach and language whereby students feel timid to approach services for help and advice.

To optimize service delivery, information accessibility for new students needs to be improved. This seems to put more emphasis on issues such as those affecting work and residential status which some students may miss out on while trying to prioritize focus on to the most pressing problems of classes and exams etc.

Symbolic Capital and cultural Configurations of class:

Such a framework based on Pierre Bourdieu allows for a conceptualization of the psychosociological dimensions of exclusion and their implications through analysis of the structural embedment and the interplay with socio-historical factors shaping the generation of cultural, symbolic capital. The relevance of his concepts to our empirical analysis is underscored through his theorization of cultural capital as embodying specific forms of knowledge in people's histories, which cannot be traded on equal terms unless cultural capital first undergoes sufficient legitimation in order to be converted into symbolic capital. To not possess cultural capital translates into failure to participate in the games of aesthetic judgment, of knowledge and cultural competence.

To explore the meaning of symbolic interaction between gender, class and ethnicity references were made to the barriers within hiring practices which specifically hinder veiled women from (Wetterer 1992 & Witz 1992) transforming their cultural capital into the labor market. Such barriers are indicative of the extents to which religion and

(Hausen 1989) gender are tied into institutions through a polarization of gender characters shaping the dissociation of profession and family life.

Drawing from a broad set of data from the youths narratives, it can be demonstrated that the Geo-political/historical background affecting symbolic capital/-cultural configurations of class have strong implications for the reproduction of socially effective stereo- types on socially discriminated categories thereby also anchoring and perpetuating the results of structured ethnicity. To briefly illustrate, participants discussed the relevance of aesthetics and fashion for shaping differentiation within processes of social interaction with dominant groups particularly because of the fundamental economic constraints crystallizing exclusion through the structural and cultural inequalities relating to the dimensions of gender, ethnicity and class.

Whereas the impact of images of background societies i.e. poverty stricken or war torn area seemed to result into discrimination based on stereo-type constructions for the Somali focus group, the Chinese focus group narrated how the perceived image of a Chinese background in terms of ability for numerical skills positively influenced their social integration (acceptance). At the socio-psychological level, however, phrases like ‘too Chinese’ as a socially distinguishing category within the Chinese community emerged in the interviews possibly constituting one of the indications of class based differentiation along the lines of cultural capital read in the salience of ‘traditional identities’ Vs ‘Post modernity identity’. The social construction of masculinities especially in relation to violence and the implications for symbolic devaluation on exclusion needs more attention. It might be useful to investigate the role of historical processes such as the colonial constructions of images including a slavery background.

Multiple modes of orientation/articulation:

This appeared adequately concretized in the Chinese adult’s women’s focus group where narratives seem to indicate that within their fourfold vulnerability, doing gender is compounded with doing ethnicity thereby structuring a plurality of orientation within a

diversity of antagonisms (See Wetterer 1992). Here a participant refers to the internalized burden of carrying the reputation of her background country and how this affects her personality and work environment: According to her narrative, her orientation is situated as a Canadian, a woman, ethnic minority but also specifically as a Chinese. In the Lebanese community, a participant referred to the double burden of harmonizing reproductive roles, gender specific household roles with employment ones; Participants also talked about the implications of a negative reputation for the orientation of minorities.

The Consciousness and Agency of the affected:

As the Lebanese focus group indicated, the heterogeneity of contradictions stemming from the threefold discrimination sometimes appears further anchored through the degree of normative internalization of subordination in female consciousness. In the interview this appeared to indirectly hinder the individual agency of some minorities in certain specific areas where they may face exclusion. Instead as Wetterer (1992) has also argued they may begin to participate in and perpetuate the hierarchies by not challenging them: The debate on uniforms as opposed to religious wear is a clear example. In addition such a view could be interpreted to concretize the theoretical arguments developed above regarding implications of subaltern consciousness and subordination socialization within family systems (Section III). Some participants argued against wearing turbans on uniforms, religious wear, claiming that affected categories should either conform or not apply for jobs within uniform strict sectors, which directly compounds exclusion on grounds of ethnicity. We do not claim that affected women are passive victims of discrimination; we illustrate only the complexity of agency within structures of exclusion.

The Media and the Social Construction of Race and Agency:

Consciousness of the interviewee demonstrates a high level of awareness regarding the racialization of violence in the media. From a pedagogical perspective, however, this seems unbacked by critical consciousness on the active role of the affected in changing

practices of oppression. What might be required is critical multiculturalism with sensitization frames empowering both minorities and mainstream communities to actively engage in social transformation on potential violence brooding contexts. This should be combined with serious policy intervention on the social construction of race in the media.

The communities expressed concern about the western cultural bias dominating the media particularly in relation to the construction of bodies and images affecting both femininity, masculinity and social values. Thus the need for exploring new ways and alternative media in which minorities actively participate to enhance a positive educational impact through cultural production. In this regard, the need for intercultural learning to promote dialogue and cohesion amongst the various communities was further expressed.

Ascription, Discursive Exclusion, Heirarchization:

Empirically the concept 'visible minority' has been strongly contested by all the interviewed communities in relation to invisibilization and exclusionary practice. In analytical terms, such a concept seems to prevent autonomous self-projection and self-concepts or even the hybridity of identities from emerging. Again we encounter reductionist notions singularizing identities and integrating the limitations of a binary logic, which fails to contextualize ethnicity as a dynamic form constituted within the interplay of historically specific constellations, power and the structural mechanisms constructing social differentiation. Thus, reinforcing a static view of identities and boundaries.

Secondly it seems to instantiate **self-ethnization** processes amongst the affected. We could be theoretically or discursively reinventing racial consciousness amongst groups, which otherwise perhaps had started adapting a mainstream i.e. 'Canadian Identity'.

Third, what the above issues further illustrate is a discrepancy between the theoretical conceptions and the realities within the empirical worlds as they relate to frames of references applied to social categories. To this extent one can highlight exclusionary practice and narrow modes of conceiving minorities through ascription within theoretical constructions and dominant discourses.²

Deconstruction of concepts through a critical analysis of evolving terminology is further emphasized through the example of the term 'community leader'. From a pedagogical perspective such a concept can be criticized in terms of promoting hierarchization and power relations vs horizontal relationships in intervention processes. It further seems to emphasize dependency on intervention agents as opposed to emancipatory practice that promotes self-directed action. It also seems to incorporate cultural deficit approaches with patronizing elements and masks (Freire 1972) the capacities of the affected as knowing subjects. Thus putting in question the empirical relevance of 'Self-Determinism'. As elsewhere mentioned, this appears not sustainable in today's context characterized by high risks of a manipulative socio-political environment. 'Community Representative' seems to offer a more pragmatic approach to the empirical world.

***Double stratification, Sex Stratification and Downward Occupational Mobility:
Ethnicity, Gendered Markets, Class segmentation:***

Lebanese women irrespective of their educational background and professional experience appear mostly trapped in the domestic sector, which when specifically compared to the general occupational segregation within the service sector affecting the male Lebanese as well, appears to constitute the lowest rungs and remuneration on the labor market. Hence their exclusion can be illustrated through their subjection to double stratification on the labor market. And it can also be viewed in the context of downward occupational mobility; power and class relations whereby minority women become confined to traditionally

² Broadly criticized in scientific literature.

genderised roles in the social reproduction sphere where they face marginalization, and invisibilization, with hardly any possibilities for their own labor mobility as they facilitate the labor force participation and status improvement for women of the majority. Furthermore it can be perceived in terms of the loss in occupational status as compared to the roles performed prior to immigrating to Canada.

Thus, the class segmentation amongst women of the majority and the increasingly socially constructed minorities.

Intercultural discourse and deconstruction of difference:

Empirically, the relevance of intercultural discourses as ideal contexts for deconstructing difference and enhancing pluralistic integration via providing possibilities for creating egalitarian relations, communication and common experiences within exclusionary processes was concretized. Basing on the example of the Lebanese dance group, it has also been demonstrated that such discourses are important in promoting social visibility, self-projection, self-esteem, community sense of belonging, group identity, etc.

The empirical findings further support the broad argument that music, performative drama and dance theatre not only traditionally form a major pedagogical context for community action and learning but also for physical training which is inseparable from the entire social fabric in many background societies. In the light of this, it seems important to juxtaposition biographies and recognize that exclusion from accessing sport facilities on the basis of social status due to increased professionalization combined with a wide lack of cultural programs within the immigration context seems to translate directly into termination of basic individual rights to social space which has been privatized; thus also affecting health standards. Not to mention class and polarizing dimensions.

Policy objectives, should aim at enhancing inclusion through transformatory pedagogy within the school system by integrating social-cultural discourses at both practical (performative) and theoretical levels. Assuming that optimizing subjective individual skills

and social public oriented competencies constitute the major goals of learning, such a pedagogy would represent linkages with other key factors including reconstruction of social space and continuity in biographies by providing familiar frames for developing community competencies, civic participation and physical training. Furthermore it can promote social visibility at diverse levels. Not to mention the wider acquisition of social, communicative- and artistic skills.

There is need for addressing the public/private divide and identifying legitimate contexts for integrating religious education in primary schools to promote critical multiculturalism and identity building. Curriculum should focus on exploration of concepts like Social Solidarity, Justice, Tolerance, Acceptance, Self-Sacrifice based on how these are illustrated or lived in the different contexts of religion (Buddhism, Hinduism, Islam, Christianity, etc.). Confessional schools may form part of the solution but public schools seem to posit the ideal context for intercultural learning, dialogue, building social skills and constructing broader based notions of a Canadian identity. Relegating religious education to the private sphere seems no longer sustainable in view of contemporary events. To avoid contradictory cultural outcomes, there is need for empowering pupils through transparent and standardized curricula as opposed to leaving the responsibility of modeling children's inner construction in the hands of manipulative private entities.

Conclusion:

The major challenges facing affected minorities seem to be both constructed and manifested within contexts of spatial inequalities. At the same time the strongest categories in data seem to reflect that the underpinning structural factors are directly linked to relations of power intersecting in gender, ethnicity, class. The interplay of such mechanisms with time, socio-historical factors and symbolic processes not only compound the experiences of exclusion but also determines the relative degree of relational differences experienced by the different groups. The Somali community seems to constitute the most vulnerable group due to the phenomena described as the 'three Rs' combined with the lack of strong networks

as newer arrivals in Ottawa. Priority consideration in policy development should focus towards this group.

Deconstruction for internationally trained minorities should constitute emancipation through the establishment of spatial equality at both levels, which reinforce each other. One hand skills and professional experience and on the other geographical segregation. For all other minorities labor market integration should be promoted at all levels. And improved institutional networking should constitute one of the major instruments advancing these objectives.

Pedagogy as transformatory action should aim at investigating the prevailing forms of consciousness at both the subjective level of the affected and the communities in which they are embedded. Focus of attention should investigate ways in which critical reflection on social justice in relation to practical relevance can be implemented as an intervention strategy.

References

- Althusser, Louis (1971): *Lenin and Philosophy*. London. New Left Books.
- Arendt, Hannah: *Der Raum des Öffentlichen und der Bereich des Privaten*. In: Werner Conze (Hrsg.) *Vita active*, München 1998. S. 33-97.
- Bourdieu, Pierre (1984): *Distinction. A social critique of the Judgment of Taste*. Routledge and Kegan Paul. London.
- ——— (1992). *The logic of practice*. Polity Press. Cambridge.
- ——— (1993): *The field of Cultural production*. In: R. Johnson (ed.). *Essays on art and literature*. Cambridge university press. Cambridge.
- Butler, Judith (1995): *Körper von Gewicht. Die diskursiven Grenzen des Geschlechts*. Berlin.
- Derrida, Jacques (1994): *Die Schrift und die Differenz*. Frankfurt/M.
- Freire, Paulo (1972): *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. Great Britain.
- Galabuzi, Grace, Edward (2001): *Canada's Economic Apartheid. The Social Exclusion of Racialized Groups in the new Century*. *Canada ???*
- Giddens, Anthony (1984): *The constitution of Society*. Polity Press, Cambridge
- Glaser, Barney G. (1978): *Advances in the Methodology of Grounded Theory*. Theoretical sensitivity. Sociology Press. U.S.A.
- Glaser, Barney G./Strauss, A.L (1967): *The discovery of grounded theory*. Chicago, Aldine.
- Guemen, Sedef (1998): *Das soziale des Geschlechts. Frauenforschung und Ethnizität*. In *Das Argument*. 224, 187-202.
- Gutierrez, Rodriguez, Encarnacion (1998): *Jongleurinnen und Seiltänzerinnen. Eine dekonstruktive Analyse von Biographien im Spannungsverhältnis von Ethnisierung und Vergehschlechtlehrung*. Frankfurt/M.
- Hausen, Karin (1989): *Öffentlichkeit und Privatheit*. In: *Journal Geschichte* . No.1
- Hausen, Karin (1976): *Die Polarisierung der Geschlechtercharaktere- Eine Spiegelung der Dissoziation von Erwerbs- und Familienleben*. In Werner Conze (Hrsg.): *Sozialgeschichte der Familie in der Neuzeit Europas*. Stuttgart S.363-399.

- Horn-Metzger, Edeltraud/ Rieger, Christine (1995). Junge Frauen and rechte Orientierung. Die Kategorie Geschlecht. In: Leiprecht Rudolf (Hrsg.). In Grenzen Verstrickt. Jugendliche and Rassismus in Europa: Ergebnisse vergleichender Jugendforschung: 133-159, Duisburg: DISS, S. 133-159.
- Lim, Lin Lean (1995): The status of women and international migration. In: United Nations (ed.): International migration policies and the status of female migrants. New York.
- Meillasoux, Claude (1981): Maidens, meal and money. New York
- Morokvasic, Mirjana (1983): Women in migration. Beyond the reductionist outlook. In: Phizacklea Annie (ed.): One way ticket. Migration and female labor. London.
- Ostner, Illona (1990): Das Konzept des Weiblichen Arbeitsvermögen. In: Autorinnengemeinschaft des Arbeiterkreises sozialwissenschaftliche Arbeitsmarktforschung (SAMF): Eklaerungsansaezte zur Geschlechtsspezifischen Strukturierung des Arbeitsmarkts, Paderborn.
- Spivak, Gayatri C. (1989): Post-structuralism, Marginality, Post-Coloniality and value. In sociocriticism X, 43-81
- Strauss, Anselm/Corbin, Juliet: Basics of qualitative research. Grounded theory procedures and techniques. U.S.A.
- Wetterer Angelika (1992): Hierarchie und Differenz im Geschlechterverhältnis. Theoretische Konzepte zur Analyse der Marginalität von Frauen in hochqualifizierten Berufen. In: Wetterer, Angelika (Hrsg.) Profession und Geschlecht, Frankfurt/M, S.13-40.
- Witz, Anne (1992): Professions and patriarchy. London/New York. Rutledge